



Cultural Indicators of Human Development in Africa

International Seminar. Maputo, 3-5 March 2004

Final report

Pre-Forum for the
International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development,
Forum Barcelona 2004, August 2004

Organised by
Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa (OCPA)
Interarts
UNESCO
Universal Forum of Cultures – Barcelona 2004

Cultural Indicators of Human Development in Africa
International Seminar. Maputo, 3-5 March 2004. Final report

LIST OF CONTENTS

Introduction

Report of Sessions

Annex 1. Programme of the Seminar

Annex 2. Task Force: Terms of Reference

Annex 3. List of Participants

Introduction

1. Within the Framework of the Universal Forum of Cultures, the Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa (OCPA), the Interarts Foundation, UNESCO and the Forum Barcelona 2004 organised an International Seminar on Cultural Indicators of Human Development in Africa. The Seminar, held in Maputo on 3-5 March 2004, aimed at drawing a clearer picture on the understanding of the role of culture in development in the context of Africa. The principal objectives were to prepare the ground for the Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development within the Universal Forum of Cultures Barcelona 2004 in August 2004, to initiate the OCPA research programme in this field and to contribute to the preparation of a regional consultation on culture and NEPAD (New Partnership for Africa's Development). The overall objective of the Seminar was to reflect the linkage between cultural indicators of development, cultural rights and development in the respect of diversities.

2. The Seminar programme consisted of three days of presentations and debate on various themes concerning the current debate on the role of culture in development, the impact of development projects on cultural communities, the transformation of new approaches into indicators and action-research initiatives, the involvement of the cultural sector and its current challenges as regards the protection of cultural communities and its role as a bridge-builder in development initiatives, among other things. The meeting was expected to produce some central thoughts such as the importance of a research agenda and of connecting the international level with the everyday ground realities of civil society, as well as some concrete observations and suggestions on cultural indicators of development in Africa.

3. The following, non-exhaustive set of questions to be addressed during the international Seminar was proposed previously:

- Which cultural indicators of development should be priority and how?
- How is cultural citizenship recognised in the African context? How is cultural freedom/cultural democracy understood in the African context?
- One main problem in developing indicators could be the access to infrastructures and knowledge-resource capacities. How could this issue be tackled?
- It is clear that culture generates rights (such as economic ones). Nevertheless, to what extent can rights in general be presented within formal and specific declarations?
- Is it possible to affirm that cultural indicators have universal validity? If not, what could be the alternative?
- What sort of indicators does cultural diversity require?
- How could culture and quality of life evaluation be developed in the African context?

4. With regard to specific thematic areas such as education and culture, creativity, access and participation and heritage, which are to be the subject of afternoon workshops within the Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development, the following questions were suggested:

- What are the key flashpoints in these thematic areas in Africa?
- What successful policies can be identified?
- What indicators exist and should exist in the African context?
- What examples of best practice can be named?

5. The programme was designed with the idea of encouraging exchange of ideas and giving space to debate. The first day of the Seminar was devoted to the general presentation and discussion on culture and development issues and assessments. The second day moved more profoundly towards the dimensions of development and cultural-rights related issues in the African context. The third day was used to present a set of conclusions, convergences and concrete results and a list of topics for the follow-up, including a research agenda and a set of items for the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development.

6. 18 participants were invited to take part in the Seminar. 21 local observers included representatives of cultural organisations in Mozambique and international agencies based in the country, as well as several journalists and diplomats.¹

7. This report presents the main subjects under discussion over the three days of the Seminar.

Wednesday 3 March 2004

Official opening of the Seminar

8. The official opening session started with an address by Ms Graça Machel, president of UNESCO's Mozambican National Commission, who stressed that although Africa is recognised as a culturally-endowed and culturally-rich continent, national programmes have generally failed to provide appropriate priority to culture. She also mentioned some of the contributions to debates on culture and development that have appeared in recent years, and highlighted the need for the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD) to integrate cultural indicators, thus ensuring the recognition of culture as one integral component of human development.

9. Ms Annamari Laaksonen introduced the activities of the Interarts Foundation and the current work involving the preparation of the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development, to be held in Barcelona next August, within the framework of the Universal Forum of Cultures – Barcelona 2004. She mentioned the work of the late Eduard Delgado, former Director of the Interarts Foundation and major inspirer of the Congress.

10. Finally, Dr Miguel Mkaima, Minister of Culture of Mozambique, indicated that the choice of Mozambique to host the Seminar encouraged its government to continue to pursue its programmes in the field of culture. He noted that only recently has the privileged place of culture in the development of human beings been properly acknowledged, as traditionally countries had often been perceived as laboratories,

¹ A full list of participants has been included as Annex 3 to this report.

where little room was granted to communities' expressions. Experience has shown that ignorance of cultural aspects curtailed the success of development programmes and that sustainability cannot be reached unless cultural aspects are not taken into account. Africa being the continent where cultural expressions are more alive and where developmental concerns are more pressing, it is particularly relevant to discuss these issues here. Finally, he officially opened the Seminar.

11. Introductory remarks by Mr Lupwishi Mbuyamba, representative of UNESCO in Mozambique, ensued. After evoking the work of the late Eduard Delgado, who had first launched the idea of the present Seminar, and expressing his sympathy to Delgado's family and colleagues, he noted the increased interest since the 1990s in the qualitative aspects of development, including culture, relevant contributions in the framework of UNESCO including the World Decade on Culture and Development (1988-1997), the publication of the World Culture Report, the international conferences in Stockholm (Cultural Policies for Development, 1998) and Florence (Culture Counts, organised jointly with the World Bank, 1999) and the Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001).

12. Establishing indicators should enable to monitor change within the culture / development interaction and to demonstrate the comparative advantage of taking a cultural approach in development strategies. Three main criteria should be the subject of cultural indicators of development – conservation, creativity and identity. Beyond the patterns of cultural supply and consumption, indicators identifying the role of culture in development and innovative forms of quantifying are needed. Likewise, tools are to be established for this relevant information to be conveyed to policy-makers, allowing them to implement appropriate programmes.

13. The two major objectives guiding the present Seminar were to help UNESCO and OCPA in their contribution to NEPAD's increased awareness of culture and to contribute to the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development to be held in Barcelona.

Presentation of the Universal Forum of Cultures – Barcelona 2004 and the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development

14. Ms Annamari Laaksonen took the floor again to present the general framework of the Universal Forum of Cultures in Barcelona and the major aims of the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development that will be held there on 23-27 August, 2004. The present Seminar was one of several international meetings within this process - thanks were due to UNESCO and OCPA for their role in preparing the Seminar and choosing key experts in Africa.

15. The Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development is related to a series of ongoing processes, including the production by the UN Committee on Economic Social and Cultural Rights of a General Comment on the Right to Take Part in Cultural Life, as well as the willingness to define indicators to measure the contribution which culture makes to human development. Other objectives of the Congress and the long-lasting process accompanying it include working closely with civil society, recognising the work that already exists and trying to find synergies with relevant parallel processes, including the World Culture Forum in Brazil and the Agenda 21 of local authorities for culture. An aim is to set an agenda for objectives to be pursued after the Congress itself.

16. Research currently underway includes the production of a questionnaire on cultural rights that is to be distributed to many international organisations and experts in the coming weeks, on issues such as how cultural rights are interpreted by different people.

17. The present Seminar should help to set priorities, to identify key aspects, themes and elements within topics and to understand the width of the topics being addressed. Four main questions (successful policies, key flashpoints, indicators that exist or should exist and examples of good practices) could be used to guide reflections on a series of issues that would later be covered in the Congress.

Afternoon session

The role of culture in development

18. Ms Angeline S Kamba started by referring to the World Decade for Culture and Development, which had asserted the world community's willingness to investigate the link between culture and development. The World Commission on Culture and Development, which produced the report *Our Creative Diversity*, addressing the human factor that had been missing from previous development strategies, could often not provide answers, but triggered the debate on those issues.

19. Due to a confusion of terms, people not actively working in the field of culture often fail to understand its relevance – culture is sometimes merely mistaken with tradition, or the creative arts, whereas it actually is much more. The cultural industries' potential to add value to the GNP and to improve livelihoods is more clearly understood by African policy-makers, who otherwise remain perplexed by culture on a broader scale. The cultural sector may not have been able to convey the message that culture is more than tradition and the arts – there remains work to be done in aligning culture with other dimensions of development.

20. Communities should be able to define their own notion of development, and that would surely include cultural elements. Without communities' choice, development cannot be sustainable.

21. The present context renders cultural dialogue more important than ever before. In the light of recent international debates on culture and development the lack of research capacity within the public sector in Africa, which prevents policy-makers from making progress in this field, was highlighted as an issue to address.

22. Sustainable development can only happen where peace, democracy, respect for human rights and for cultural diversity exist, thence culture is to provide an environment where ways of living together can flourish and interact in harmony.

23. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- What is human development for Africa today? How should cultural indicators be integrated in human development strategies?
- Development is a process within culture. Culture cannot be treated as something external, it is directly linked to development.

- The debate on „culture AND development“ reminds somehow of old discussions on „women AND development“ as if they were separate processes – they actually interact with one another.
- Many development strategies have failed because they neglected cultural elements of the people whom strategies were targeted at. Development is a cultural process because, in its bringing of change, development affects people’s minds, attitudes, etc. Why are we still discussing this, two decades on?
- How much of the body of knowledge created by UNESCO has been taken up in policy-making, what strategies have been put in place to convey that knowledge?
- What is missing is the ability to put all individual initiatives in a process of continuity. Policy-makers generally do not have enough perspective to identify the long-term debates on culture and development.
- Why does culture continue to be the stepchild in development while everyone claims it should be central? Is it because cultural activists have not been able to make their case? Have they not been able to set up a proper social movement? Or is it because culture is to remain always on the margins?
- In the creative arts, people of enormous talent should have the power to transmit the messages we need to convey, to promote culture in a more positive, global manner. Need for more integration, culture not to be seen as a world apart.
- Indicators are not good forever, they change over time. How can indicators be developed that enable us to assess and anticipate change?
- Poverty Reduction Strategies at the national level also tend to ignore the role of culture, whilst the UN Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) fail to include cultural indicators – how could the cultural sector derive indicators to contribute to MDGs?

24. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- It would have been good for a document to be produced before the Seminar by African experts on how to face the challenges of development and cultural indicators.
- 22 years after the MONDIACULT Conference on Cultural Policies in Mexico, it could be time to produce indicators to evaluate how governments which attended it have applied its conclusions and integrated cultural policies in development – it would probably show most have failed.
- Those of us who relate to policy-makers may not be articulating ideas properly, and maybe we are not sure about what we need to convey – there is a difficulty in identifying indicators. The recent OCPA Steering Committee meeting identified a need to develop guides, manuals, tools to convince those who need to be convinced. We may also need to integrate culture with other areas of development, proving that culture runs through other fields.
- Culture is often treated in a very segmented way, instead of the holistic approach it deserves – we are perpetuating a mentality of isolating this crucial element of development. Culture ought to be embedded into the frame of producing human beings who will be policy-makers, decision-makers, developmentalists – there is a need to make it an integral part of education systems.
- We need cultural movements, NGOs to carry these ideas forward proactively.
- Need to include culture in the work programmes of national ministries of Planning.
- Need to work at the local government level.

ICTs and Community Development in Africa

25. Mr Pierre Dandjinou started by describing the emerging global network economy, which generates changes in the way wealth is produced and the ways in which people interact. It also creates digital opportunities. In this framework, complex models of dealing with development should replace linear models, isolated stakeholder initiative should be replaced by cooperation, and top-down approaches in policy-making should be combined with bottom-up approaches.

26. The three major issues which were subject of debate during the recent World Summit on Information Society in Geneva were bridging the digital divide (who's going to pay?); cultural diversity (is the Internet society to be monolingual? Shouldn't local languages have a place?); and the right to information & knowledge (it is not only about information, as UNESCO indicated).

27. The UN-approved Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) include 8 targets and 48 indicators, but no cultural indicators.

28. Several ways were identified through which ICTs can empower the underserved – radio (local community empowerment), cellular phones (self-empowerment), PDAs (early warning of disasters, medical assistance, market prices), „information kiosks“ (public points where ICTs are used as a tool to deliver a set of services to underserved communities, increasing the potential for networking and enhancing economic sustainability). In these ways, ICTs can enable communities to leapfrog. The ultimate mission of tools such as the information kiosks is to improve capacity development and to contribute to social and cultural development: including health, community safety, reduced mortality, economic development, cultural fulfilment, farm productivity and wealth creation. A few examples of how ICTs can help the poor in several African countries were also presented.

29. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- Not so long ago, the belief was that ICTs were not relevant for Africa, for the problems here were of a different nature. But it is now clear that ICTs are there to stay and they are fundamental to everyone.
- Since globalisation can also encompass cultural domination and since ICTs can facilitate that, the challenge is to make culture a part of the process of learning, ensuring that ICTs are added to traditional ways of obtaining information and knowledge, instead of replacing them.
- Several concepts which are fundamental to development strategies are culturally defined. When a network of health services decided to facilitate services to people but to demand a small-cost entrance fee, except for the very poor, they encountered difficulties how to determine who was „very poor“? The notion depends on each group and its culture.
- ICTs accelerate processes of communication. They are a very important component to be integrated in people's lives, thus in their cultures. They can enable communities to see how other communities are coping with their challenges, and can provide relevant examples. Do we need to integrate culture in ICTs? Rather ICTs need to be integrated in cultural life.
- ICTs should not replace, but coexist with, traditional forms of learning, because the use of modern technologies may not be sustainable for communities in the long term.

- How do we ensure that, since the tool brings a message with it, this message contributes to the development of targeted communities? How could messages be owned by the people?
- The political economy and the political sociology of ICTs need to be taken into account – they are a vehicle of the globalising economy, where disparities have never been as big as now. They are also a vehicle of a knowledge-based society which marginalises traditional knowledge systems. In addition to the potential for liberation, the potential for imperialism should be discussed as well.

30. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- It all boils down to capacity development – mindsets which are able to negotiate the opportunities provided by ICTs and adapting them are needed. Ultimately African countries should be able to bargain, and to reject tools which do not suit their needs.
- Should cultural indicators be included in the MDGs or shouldn't the existing, fundamental indicators be influenced by culture, culturalised, rather than having culture marginalised as separate indicators?
- MDGs are by no means a comprehensive document, we should not be limited to them. A compact approved globally needs to be indigenised, customised to the needs of every place.
- Existing indicators in other fields could be disaggregated to see whether they provide valuable data on culture – disaggregating existing indicators has worked for the human rights community, which was facing the lack of proper data collection and could take advantage of existing data on fields such as discrimination.

Thursday 4 March 2004

Presentation of the conclusions of the Workshop on NEPAD and Culture

31. At the initiative of UNESCO, an experts' meeting was held in Abidjan in September 2003 in order to prepare the practical framework for a wider Pan-African consultation process, under the joint auspices of NEPAD's secretariat and UNESCO, which should reinforce the place of culture in NEPAD's programme of action. Mr Lupwishi Mbuyamba presented the main issues discussed and the conclusions of that meeting.

32. Issues that were subject to discussion included the need to provide a link between culture and NEPAD's priorities (agriculture, infrastructure, health, etc.), the necessary changes in mentality (is NEPAD going to succeed if African populations continue to expect to receive support from outside?) and the cultural areas that could more easily be integrated in NEPAD's strategy (including cultural industries, crafts, heritage, cultural tourism).

33. The wide Pan-African consultation, due to be held later in 2004, is expected to lead to results such as strengthening of the place of culture in NEPAD, definition of priority domains, adoption of a cultural approach for NEPAD's programme of action and

definition of monitoring and coordination mechanisms for the effective implementation of proposals adopted by NEPAD. Reactions to the report of the Abidjan meeting, which has been distributed to regional and subregional organisations, are currently being compiled.

Research plan of OCPA

34. Mr Máté Kovács presented the origins and activities of the Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa (OCPA). The idea to establish an observatory emerged at an African experts' meeting in 1998 and was reinforced by the action plan of the Stockholm intergovernmental conference later that year. Among its key objectives defined are the collection and dissemination of information on cultural development and cultural life in Africa, the provision of a knowledge-based policy analysis mechanism and the assessment of policy-development trends.

35. In its initial phase, OCPA's work is focusing on mapping existing information, developing information services (databases, an e-bulletin, a web site, repertory of documents), organising events (which help to identify needs). Activities in the recently approved programme and budget for 2004 and 2005 also include research activities that can generate new information and knowledge, such as mapping the cultural policies being currently implemented in Africa and providing manuals or guidelines to assess the effectiveness and efficiency of existing actions and policies and to map existing resources. A study on cultural rights in Africa could be produced, as a first step towards a meeting on this issue to be held in 2005. The cultural indicators of development and the development of training materials were also identified as research priorities.

36. Attenders were invited to provide advice particularly in the field of cultural indicators of development - to prove the relevance of investing in culture and to show the comparative advantage of adopting a cultural approach in sustainable human development strategies. Questions suggested included the following:

- Which are the priority needs? (In the culture sector and in the culture/development interaction)
- Which are, to your knowledge, the projects, past, on-going and planned (if any) related to these priority issues? Theoretical or methodological studies, pilot projects, case studies, best practices, evaluation reports
- Which indicators could have the greatest impact for advocacy purposes?
- Which are the indicators of which the elaboration seems most viable? Taking into account the demand, the available expertise and knowledge, the available financial resources.
- Which are the most practical approaches? Review the existing literature and research concerning Africa; prepare some selected priority indicators and test them; impact analysis.
- Which are the most important potential partners for such a project? For carrying out the research: CODESRIA, African Futures, ENDA, CRDI/IDRC, Pan African Association of Anthropologists; for testing the indicators in experimental projects: UN agencies, other development organisations, etc.
- Are you interested in participating in the planning and implementation of such a project? Who could do what?

37. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- NEPAD may not have too much interest in a conference focusing on culture and development, but they are preparing an Intellectuals' Conference in November – maybe the cultural issues could be mainstreamed there. The same could apply to OCPA's priorities – would it be feasible to include cultural governance in the agenda of the African peer-review mechanism? Let's use this opportunity as much as we can.
- In its initial years, OCPA should focus on reinforcing its database, focusing research efforts there, for no other institution in Africa is able to do that efficiently.
- As NEPAD is seldom providing funds to projects, it could be necessary to pay more attention to the local private sector, including African foundations.

Cultural Diversity and Human Development Indicators

38. Mr Mike van Graan started his intervention by observing that both human development and cultural diversity intend to enlarge people's choices, and then went on to seek what other contact points existed.

39. In the context of globalisation, subsidies to cultural industries are regarded as distortions to the free market (GATS 1994, now WTO). Yet since certain countries can for historical reasons compete more effectively than others, they end up having unimpeded access to international markets. This affects opportunities for local cultural workers, can lead to homogenisation and puts democracy and choice under threat. Governments are often inclined to decrease their support for domestic creativity. As in colonial and apartheid times, foreign forces impact on our cultural practices, and affect the nature of democracy and the exercise of human rights. In the context of globalisation, promoting cultural diversity means ensuring that local cultural products be not completely superseded, that people be given wider choices.

40. Human Development Reports show huge disparities in quality of life among countries, and disparities seem to be exacerbated by the current form of globalisation. Evidence shows no correlation between the expansion of the free market and an increase in democracy and respect for human rights, or between lack of democracy and low human development indexes (HDI) or between adopting the free market and increasing HDI. Human development indicators should be complemented with democracy and human rights indicators.

41. Struggling for human development implies in turn struggling for economic justice, for a sustainable environment, for democracy, for human rights, for cultural diversity, for cultural rights, for development that respects culture. UNESCO's proposal for a Convention on Cultural Diversity, the possibility of a global fund to support cultural industries (particularly in the developing world), the allocation to culture of a percentage of all development funds and the establishment of a universal indicator focusing on artists' status, rights and working conditions as a measure of human rights, democracy, cultural rights and human development were suggested as possible measures to increase the enjoyment of human development and cultural diversity.²

² For the related discussion see below, after the next presentation.

Human, including cultural, rights and human development indicators

42. Ms Julia Hausermann started her presentation by paying tribute to the late Eduard Delgado, to whom she dedicated Ben Okri's poem Grief, its call to „sweeten humanity's hours“ referring both to Eduard Delgado's contribution and the aims of the present Seminar.

43. Describing the human rights approach to development that her organisation Rights & Humanity (R&H) has refined over the years, Ms Hausermann identified some elements that were relevant to the present discussion as well – a universal framework such as that provided by human rights is needed for indicators to be valid over time and across countries; the human rights approach to development has already been adopted by UN agencies and provides a basis for indicators based on concrete standards. Both human rights and culture can be regarded as separate policy areas, but they also need to be integrated on a wide range of policy fields.

44. Among the strands and notions of culture within which indicators could be developed, were the role of culture within development strategies, the enjoyment derived from cultural participation, the preservation of culture, nurturing and respecting cultural diversity, etc. Since the early 1990s, R&H has tried to develop a human rights approach to cultural policies, based on standards, focusing on existing disparities, providing a people-centred approach to development, a holistic, participatory, multisectorial approach. Emphasis is placed on equal access and participation, respect for all, mutual respect to all cultures. References to these and other relevant issues (participation in cultural life, self-determination, right to use natural resources, etc.) are found in international standards including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination and the African Charter on Human and People's Rights. Examples from Canada and India show how existing law can be applied to protect and to foster communities' cultural rights.

45. The Human Development Index provides a framework within which to develop indicators, but several difficulties are experienced concerning cultural rights indicators – how to identify what a violation is, how to quantify them. Qualitative indicators are needed. The potential to disaggregate existing indicators according to cultural criteria could be considered. Even though indicators cannot be achieved in every key area of cultural rights, a focus could be placed on those that are fundamental – creators' freedom, the ability to take part in cultural life – and an agreement could be reached on the goals and targets for which indicators ought to be developed, such as the need to overcome existing inequalities in the enjoyment of cultural rights and freedoms, the preservation of cultural artifacts and the development of culture for the benefit of all. Relevant case studies could be used to support this development.

46. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- On what level of government (regional, national, international) should advocacy start for cultural rights? Who's accountable?
- There is a need for universal indicators that cut across all national boundaries, which cannot be discussed upon. Even though much of this is to be applied at national level, it

should derive from international agreements, to prevent countries from considering it not applicable.

- Interventions should probably be combined at the national and international level. At the national level, bottom-up and top-down approaches ought to be combined.

47. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- A universal indicator focusing on artists' status, rights and working conditions could be used as a measure of human rights, democracy, cultural rights and human development in a given country.

- Existing indicators related to several dimensions of development could be disaggregated according to cultural criteria, thus providing valuable information on cultural issues.

- Even though indicators cannot be achieved in every key area of cultural rights, a focus could be placed on those that are fundamental – including creators' freedom, the ability to take part in cultural life.

Human rights, culture and gender

48. The presentation by Ms Osvalda Joana highlighted that although international standards on human rights recognise a dignity inherent to all human beings and enshrine equal rights for men and women, the cultural uses of communities lead to some rights being enjoyed only by men.

49. Examples in Mozambique show that a social order favouring men is sustained, through the distribution of resources, the social acceptance of male superiority and gender violence, socialisation processes that incline women to submission and men's control of women's sexuality. Information on women's rights in Africa ought to be disseminated, all violations of women's rights should be denounced and educational programmes developed.³

Women Writers: Rights and Duties in Community Development

50. Ms Lilia Momplé started by highlighting that even though the majority of the humanity are women, a very small share of international decisions are taken by them.

51. Mozambican women have played key roles throughout history, both in the transmission of cultural values, social habits and art forms and in their contribution to households, although visibility has always tended to be weak. Recent decades have witnessed a surge in the number of women artists as well as women's involvement in economic, social and political life, but patterns of discrimination continue to exist.

52. The proportion of women writers is low relative to the total number of published writers, as historical and cultural factors – e.g. preference for educating male children – mean that illiteracy is higher among women. High rates of illiteracy, social preferences

³ For the related discussion see below, after the next presentation.

for activities other than culture, poverty, the lack of policy incentives to writers and educational curricula that seldom promote literature are other elements that affect the value and self-esteem of writers, both male and female, in society.

53. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- Structural problems caused by historical contexts, the construction of families, challenges posed by colonial and postcolonial period, the definition of power relations within families continue to be fundamental elements.
- More value should be given to the achievements in the field of gender relations as well, which give patterns for further success.
- The ideology and philosophy underpinning these uneven gender relations need to be understood and addressed.
- When political programmes say that they stand by African traditions, they should clarify what traditions they refer to.

54. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- Evidence such as the one presented in this session proves that elements of culture can also be an obstacle to development.

Afternoon session

The African angle: cultural indicators of human development in Africa

55. Mr Paul Nchoji Nkwi presented some of the core concepts underpinning the development of cultural indicators of human development in Africa. Development can be understood as „the capacity of a people to innovate, create, borrow, adapt, transform and integrate new values, new ways into their social structure in order to solve basic human problems that face them daily“. Performance relevant to development could be measured in several cultural areas and domains, thus determining how cultures are holistically part of the development process, how they are mainstreamed or marginalised in a country's system. Suggestions for measurement included the following dimensions:

- participation: listening to the people in programme design and policy-making, ensuring participation in institutional action, ownership of processes;
- the degree to which political systems recognise their internal diversity (languages, ways of life, etc.), the recognition of pluralism, the existence of elements of integration;
- in the educational system, where population is enculturated, the transmission of foreign values and norms and of traditional values, and how these are absorbed and internalised by the youth could be assessed;
- the existence of preservation measures for oral traditions and the salvaging of local languages would also provide valuable information in the African context;
- in order to convince policy-makers that investment in cultural heritage is long-term positive, indicators of effectiveness should be available;
- how much of indigenous knowledge has become part of intellectual property;

- the reliance on different types of cultural tourism (international mass tourism, diaspora tourism, domestic tourism), the latter being particularly relevant to the enriching of national consciousness.

56. Policies with clear goals and strategies are needed in a range of fields, including the retrieval of stolen cultural assets, raising the profile of culture within governments, protective legislation for sites and monuments, surveys of nautical archaeological sites, environmental impact assessment and archaeological surveys in all major development projects, the maintenance of historical towns as living communities, the establishment or strengthening of national councils for culture defining and coordinating policies, capacity building and the revision of educational programmes.⁴

57. Mr Alioune Sall's presentation, entitled Identifying cultural indicators of human development in socio-economic development processes in Africa – in the light of the conclusions of the prospective study Africa 2025, introduced one of four future scenarios identified by the Africa 2025 study.

58. Called „The lions mark their territory“ and being close to sustainable human development, in this scenario Africa would accept the constraints of development without denying its own heritage, remaining faithful to the knowledge of ancestors and taking advantage of contemporary contributions.

59. With production-oriented development creating unbearable tensions, a logic more attentive to the relation between people and social capital would unfold; governance systems would also change, an enabling environment for development being created and alliances being established with symbolic authorities. The scenario encompasses eight major features, including increased effectiveness of the popular economy (informal market); greater role of cultural entrepreneurs; increased productivity, by subcontracting to the popular economy; more attention paid to the conservation of national resources; a marked improvement in public services; decentralisation; development of effective citizenship; and democracy.

60. For this to happen, a number of cultural variables are key and could be measured with indicators, including the following:

- strong civil society;
- the development paradigm understands culture as a foundation of development;
- capacity to build a vision for the future of Africa, as other continents have done;
- a selection of African values takes place, some being discarded, some brought to the fore;
- importance of social capital;
- alliances with cultural stakeholders and activists are built;
- increased investment in training and information, for a broad-based consensus to emerge;
- a shared democratic culture (rule of law prevailing), a shared widespread conviction that integration is the requirement for the future;
- acknowledgement of the importance of cultural diversity and creativity.

⁴ For the related discussion see below, after the next presentation.

61. Other issues requiring some reflection for the described scenario to emerge, and which could be the subject of indicators as well, include human security, autonomy (and the question of subsidiarity), individual and collective self-reliance, the sense of belonging to a community, the notion of participation, political and civil liberties and respect and internalisation of differences.

62. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- Some of the African values and products that have been exported to other regions have done so only partially (the concept of ubuntu, elements of the music industry) – in spite of our value, we appear to be limiting, restraining ourselves.
- They may not have been marketed properly. The research capacity in Africa tends to be quite limited, the material and human resources earmarked for it are limited, and researchers have not been able to build partnerships with relevant stakeholders. Africa is not present in the contemporary flow of information and its knowledge is marginalised, which leads us to think „we do not exist“. Africa needs to build strategic partnerships at national level and find its place in the global market of ideas.
- How are the results of projects such as Agenda 2025 promoted? To what extent are they linked to strategies such as NEPAD?
- Those who have taken part in consultations leading to the production of agendas for the future (Agenda 2016, Botswana) indicate the potential for making all departments of administration pay attention to common aims, and everyone becoming accountable. Only if you have a vision can positive steps be taken.
- You can define your scenario or let others do it. Constructing scenarios involves gathering information from a series of factors, including where you stand, the external environment where you live, what people want to do. Once the scenario has been drawn, an internalisation process is needed - what is at stake is not the scenario's feasibility, but the capacity to turn it into reality (internalisation).
- Building scenarios is a complete cultural change. We Africans must look many years down the road, we cannot continue to navigate on the basis of what we see just in front.

63. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- Importance of education and the culture of conservation, the latter being often lacking, as the experience in Mozambique shows – those who led the armed struggle for independence are mostly alive, they should be recorded before dying if evidence is to remain.
- One critical area where the inculturative process needs to take place is the educational system.
- Africa needs to build strategic partnerships at national level and find its place in the global market of ideas.
- Cultural performance in the following dimensions could be subject to measurement: participation; recognition of internal diversity and pluralism and existence of elements of integration; transmission and internalisation of traditional and foreign values in the educational system; existence of preservation measures for oral traditions ; the long-term effectiveness of investment in the cultural heritage; share of indigenous knowledge becoming part of intellectual property; reliance on different types of cultural tourism (international mass tourism, diaspora tourism, domestic tourism).
- Other cultural variables that could be taken into account when building indicators include strong civil society; the place of culture within the development paradigm; the

capacity to build a vision for the future of Africa; the extent to which certain African values are privileged; social capital; alliances with cultural stakeholders and activists; investment in training and information; a shared democratic culture; acknowledgement of the importance of cultural diversity and creativity.

The function of cultural policy in human development strategies and the contribution of culture to economic development (cultural industries and cultural enterprises): possible cultural development indicators of human development.

64. In his presentation, Mr Stephen Chifunyise distinguished the notions of indicators of cultural development and cultural indicators of human development. In most countries, efforts have concentrated on the former, whereas the latter provide a truly new development.

65. Indicators of cultural development include the indexes of participation in cultural life (access to communal cultural facilities, membership of societies, etc. belonging to societies, festivals), education levels, individual ownership of durable cultural consumer goods, the index of production of cultural goods, the index of time spent in leisure activities, the index of consumption of cultural goods, the index of general expenditure on cultural goods and services, and the index of public expenditure on culture. Although these indicators are used in quantitative evaluation of activities in institutionalised culture, they are also useful to planners, policy implementers, legislators, stakeholders in the cultural sector, for they provide a useful evaluative framework to ask for the development of culture in African countries.

66. Yet building cultural indicators of human development is important as well – issues such as cultural rights, democracy, gender equality need to be kept in mind when constructing, or using – as some already do – such indicators. These aspects of debate need to be brought to the local level in Africa and are to involve the critical capacity of a diverse cultural community. A local basket of cultural indicators of human development must pass on, through the critical stakeholders in the cultural sector – not just intellectuals – to the international forum.⁵

67. Mr James Sengendo's presentation introduced the cultural development indicators applied in the Kawempe Project, Kampala, Uganda. The project, supported by UNESCO, was implemented in a semiurban division where the majority of inhabitants live below the poverty line, many families are single-parent and rates of STDs/HIV infection are estimated to be high, closely linked with poverty.

68. Based on Bandura's Health Belief Model which indicates a significant correlation exists between personal traits (cognitive or mental capacities, attitudes, perception, self esteem), behaviour and environment, the project focused on indicators for behaviour change, for which individuals need to understand the severity of the problem. Another hypothesis is that community dialogue on HIV/AIDS is positively related with collective actions that prevent the spread of HIV/AIDS. The community dialogue model takes advantage of existing, traditional forms of community communication and helps communities to identify and address important unexpressed concerns.

⁵ For the related discussion see below, after the next presentation.

69. Many development organisations find traditional cultural indicators irrelevant, therefore indicators that refer to other fields of development are needed. The Kawempe project used indicators to measure variables such as the type of information reaching people in communities (including the „hard to reach“), community reference points linking youth to service centres, key community-based communication channels, the cultural networks identified, number and type of community meetings, types of community resources, traditional means of sending messages identified, as well as indicators related to participatory learning and action, capacity building indicators and cognitive indicators.

70. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- Need to be able to make these experiences known wider, as several agencies appear to be working with similar aims and different models.
- However, most UN agencies active in the field of HIV/AIDS tend to work together.
- The community dialogue model is in a sense innovative. The ability of research institutions to work locally with people is the key, a way of testing the validity of results, and needs to be encouraged.

71. Suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- In addition to traditional indicators of cultural development, cultural indicators of human development which take account of issues such as cultural rights, democracy and gender equality are needed.
- In the Kawempe project, the following variables indicating the relation between culture and other dimensions of development were used - type of information reaching people in communities (including the „hard to reach“), community reference points linking youth to service centres, key community-based communication channels, cultural networks identified, number and type of community meetings, types of community resources, traditional means of sending messages identified, participatory learning and action, capacity building indicators and cognitive indicators.

Friday 5 March 2004

Conclusions from previous days – summary

72. Ms Annamari Laaksonen presented the main conclusions of previous days' discussions – a wide range of ideas and issues which are difficult to summarise. The aims of the last day included coming with an agenda for research and follow-up and identifying themes for a working group or similar to pursue the aims of the Seminar. Central themes and ideas, suggestions and questions identified in the course of the Seminar included the following:

- Suggestion to produce a document by African experts on how to face the challenges of development and cultural indicators.
- Moving further in the discussion beyond questioning or defining the role of culture in development in Africa or elsewhere.
- Finding ways and strategies to integrate culture in other areas of development
- Looking for new partnerships – and strengthening those already existing – to combine the local, regional, national and international level.
- Integration of ICT in cultural life.
- Finding ways for OCPA to further circulate and exchanging information.
- Concentrating research on a few selected areas.
- Best practices toolkit for policy-makers.
- Developing economic arguments to clarify key elements.
- Developing indicators to measure progress.
- Selecting two to three priority indicators.
- Setting goals and objectives.
- Who decides what's important for people and what culture is to be promoted.
- Setting policies with clear goals.
- Studying cultural impact assessment systems.
- Resources for research – partnerships at regional level.
- Development policies with clear goals.
- Importance of heritage.
- Building strategic partnerships.
- Investing in training.
- Examining African values.
- Building strategic partnerships.
- Time has come for a social movement for culture, as also suggested by the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development.
- How to move from action plans to realities?
- Importance of creativity and expressiveness.

73. Concerning possible topics where to elaborate indicators and undertake further research, the following had been identified:

- Various dimensions of ICT, including cultural diversity.
- Right to information and knowledge.
- The cultural dimension of existing indicators of human development.
- Education, including reviewing training curricula, and the importance of history and archives.
- Democracy and human rights.
- Historical context of traditions and underpinning ideologies.
- Participation (including how it is understood, access to cultural services, etc).
- Preservation measures of intangible heritage.
- Rights of creators, including artists' status.
- Action plan to implement cultural elements in human rights.
- Women's rights and gender relations.
- Intellectual property.
- Cultural tourism.
- Production of cultural goods.
- Preservation measures of intangible heritage.
- Intellectual property in its various forms.
- Negative aspects of culture and cultural traditions.
- Indicators related to cultural rights and rights evolving cultural rights (expression, access, etc).

- Security.
- Autonomy.
- Solidarity.
- Sense of belonging to a community.
- Discrimination.
- Production of cultural goods.
- Identity.
- Peace and democracy.
- Gender.
- Equality (of opportunities, etc).
- Transversal aspects, including networking.

74. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- How to prioritise within the long list that has been presented?
- One very relevant factor is capacity building for civil society organisations and the development of more partnerships with them.
- Also public-private partnerships (PPP).
- Database management systems at the national level.

75. In addition to the items in the lists above, suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- A systematic evaluation, including indicators, of governments' performance as regards their commitments under international agreements in the field of culture could be carried out – this could be a research project for OCPA or UNESCO.
- Knowledge of human rights may be a relevant human rights indicator. It can be enhanced through a more central place for human rights in educational curricula and awareness-raising campaigns.

Cultural indicators of human development – priorities for research and action

76. Mr Augustin Hatar started his presentation by referring to the background of development models and the role of culture within them, increasingly recurrent since the 1980s. In this framework, work remains to be done though in the identification of good practices and best approaches. Topics which could form the research agenda in the next phase included the following:

- Production of an annotated, comprehensive bibliography about what knowledge exists in the field of cultural indicators in development.
- A review of facts and figures providing evidence in this field.
- Comprehensive research on the understanding of poverty in rural areas.
- Studies on social cohesion – how to make people in a country work together?
- Communicating issues – how to communicate achievements in the cultural field, including methodologies to let others know and engage them.
- Study on the reasons for the lack of private funding - why aren't African foundations involved in these processes?
- Need for research and training (capacity building) on how to better market African cultural products?

- Documenting the myths, beliefs, traditions, taboos – cultural elements hindering development.
- Clear framework for cultural indicators – statistical measures can to a certain extent serve our needs, but what approaches can be applied in order to interpret statistical data better?
- Research on religious issues that negatively affect culture and development nowadays.
- New approaches to HIV/AIDS from the cultural constituency.

77. In the discussion that ensued, the following issues were raised:

- Need for facts and figures, the social dynamics and how to understand them.
- Positive examples exist for several of the issues mentioned. The Harare International Festival of the Arts has grown over the years, and receives outstanding support from the private sector, in spite of the very difficult economic context. Private initiatives by some successful businesspeople also show a commitment sometimes towards the communities from which they come, the cultural identity which was at the origin of their success. Concerning oral knowledge, Zimbabwe's National Archives also done extensive work in collecting and documenting oral history and traditions. These examples could be emulated.
- The establishment of a small foundation for cultural promotion in Africa could be an issue to be considered by OCPA.
- In Africa everything seems to be a priority, we need to identify the true ones. In addition to the cultural practices which hinder development, a focus could be on the elements to appreciate in a culture, those which enable peoples to move forward.
- Generation and management of knowledge through culture.
- Why is it that African foundations do not invest in culture? Because cultural activists are still living in their ivory towers. Culture does not belong to cultural activists and should not be divorced from the macroeconomic framework. The gap between the cultural and economic constituencies needs to be addressed.
- Need to find out what information already exists, including what multilateral intergovernmental organisations in Africa are doing.

78. In addition to the items in the list above, suggestions and recommendations regarding indicators and the role of culture in development included the following:

- We have been very negative on the contribution of culture and have not highlighted best practices enough - we should find ways to package, market, communicate them.
- We need to determine our strength as a group and select what of the long list of suggested tasks we can tackle. Need to be specific, measurable, achievable, realistic and to have a set time framework.

Proposal by OCPA on possible approaches for developing indicators

79. Mr Máté Kovács referred to a recent World Bank social development strategy which identifies three key indicators – cohesion, inclusion, accountability – and wished something similar could be achieved in the field of culture. That could be the result of selecting within a longer list of potential indicators. OCPA's possible approaches for developing indicators included:

- Using indicators concerning other areas of cultural relevance (having a cultural component), such as human rights, peace, security, gender, poverty, social development, literacy, education, media, governance, education, environment, population, etc.
- Combining indicators concerning other areas with cultural characteristics (school attendance, employment, birth-rate, fertility, age of marriage and belonging to ethnic, linguistic, religious groups (minorities), school attendance and gender, African content in education, cultural content of education, local contents and languages in the media and ICT, etc.).
- Culturalising (customising) existing indicators, using HDI or MDG indicators for mainstreaming the cultural approach.
- Adapting existing indicators to the African context.
- Using the model of indicators of the human rights approach to development (R&H).

80. In this context, the following indicators of cultural development, whether existing or to be developed, could be named:

- funding culture (public and private, foundations, external contributions);
- participation in and access to the cultural life of the community (organised and non organised activities), as defined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and UNESCO's Recommendation Concerning the Participation in and Contribution to Cultural Life by the People at Large (Nairobi, 1976).
- conservation (proposed by the Seminar „Measuring Culture and Development: Prospects and Limits of Constructing Cultural Indicators“, Florence, 1999). UNESCO definitions available in recommendations and conventions concerning tangible and intangible heritage.
- creativity (proposed by the Florence Seminar, 1999), a reference being provided by UNESCO's Recommendation Concerning the Status of the Artist (Belgrade, 1980).
- freedom of arts and expression
- identity (proposed by the Florence Seminar, 1999)
- Quantitative indicators concerning production, consumption, attendance, people's cultural expenditure, as well as leisure time devoted to culture and entertainment.

81. This was seen as a non-exhaustive list, as was the following list of existing or to be developed cultural indicators of development:

- Respect for cultural diversity (pluralism or domination) – a key reference being UNESCO's Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (Paris, 2001).
- Integration of cultural objectives and cultural approach in development strategies and programmes – key references including the Declaration of the Intergovernmental Conference on Cultural Policies in Africa (Accra, 1975) and the Stockholm Plan of Action on Cultural Policies for Development (1998).
- People's participation in development (bottom-up) planning, implementation and evaluation – listening to people, ownership, etc.
- Cultural Soundness Assessment (study on foreseeable impact on and by cultures) – following the model of social soundness assessment.
- Assessment and mobilization of cultural resources and identification of cultural obstacles.
- Integration of traditional knowledge, know-how, skills, materials as well as resource and environment management systems.

82. General reference texts to the issues highlighted above can be found in documents including the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the African Charter on Human and People's Rights, the Pan-African Cultural Manifesto (Algiers, 1969), the Declaration of the Intergovernmental Conference on Cultural Policies in Africa (Accra, 1975), the Cultural Charter for Africa (Port Louis, 1976), the Mexico Declaration on Cultural Policies (MONDIACULT, 1982), the Declaration of the Heads of State and Government of the Organisation of African Unity on the Cultural Aspects in the Lagos Plan of Action (Addis Ababa, 1984), the Language Plan of Action for Africa (Addis Ababa, 1986), the Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore (Paris, 1989), the Plan of Action for the Development of Cultural Industries in Africa (OAU Summit, Dakar, 1992), the final report of the Intergovernmental Conference on Language Policies in Africa (Harare, 1997), the World Congress on the Status of the Artist (including its final declaration, Paris, 1997), the Stockholm Plan of Action on Cultural Policies for Development (1998), the Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (Paris, 2001) and the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (Paris, 2003).

83. A suggestion was made for a few of the indicators named above to be selected in order to increase feasibility - freedom of expression, cultural diversity, participation and cultural funding could be the fundamental indicators.

84. On the other hand, a revised version of basic texts (NEPAD, MDGs) could be prepared and disseminated for advocacy and mobilisation purposes, where cultural objectives, references and considerations that have so far been missing could be integrated.

Final discussions – setting up of task force

85. In the discussion that ensued, a proposal was made for a task force to be set up, its mission including the following measures:

- a document to be prepared under the auspices of UNESCO, OCPA, NEPAD and Interarts, to draft a goals matrix including goals, strategies, targets, key results and sets of indicators associated;
- document to be distributed widely;
- the operational group to meet and produce the final working document by late July 2004;
- document to be disseminated and consolidated widely, to places including the Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development in August and several African fora.

86. The following discussion agreed that the task force be formed by Mr Stephen Chifunyise, Mr Fernando Dava, Ms Julia Hausermann, Mr Paul Nchoji Nkwi and Mr Alioune Sall. Certain areas, such as HIV/AIDS, could benefit from insight by other expert, including Ms Alinah Segobye and Mr James Sengendo. The document emerging from this process should also inform UNDP's work and benefit from UNDP's cultural indicators.⁶

⁶ The task force held its first meeting on Saturday 6 March 2004. The terms of reference agreed in the course of that meeting have been added as Annex 2 to this report.

Annex 1

Cultural Indicators of Human Development in Africa
International Seminar. Maputo, 3-5 March 2004

PROGRAMME OF THE SEMINAR

Wednesday 3 March 2004

- 09.30 Official opening of the Meeting
- Welcome address by Ms. Graça Machel, President of UNESCO National Commission
- Address by Ms. Annamari Laaksonen, Interarts representative
- Opening speech by Dr. Miguel Mkaima, Minister of Culture
- Presentation of the participants
- Introductory remarks by Mr. Lupwishi Mbuyamba
- 10.30 Presentation of the Universal Forum of Cultures Barcelona 2004 and the International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development by the representative of the Forum and by Ms. Annamari Laaksonen
- 11.30 Discussion
- 12.00 Lunch
- 14.00 The role of culture in development – Presentations by Ms. Angeline Kamba and Mr. Kabeya Tshikuku (paper)
- 15.00 Discussion
- 15.30 Coffee break
- 16.00 ICT's and Community Development in Africa by Mr. Pierre Dandjinou
- 17.00 Open discussion
- 18.00 End of session

Thursday 4 March 2004

Cultural Indicators of Human Development in Africa. Maputo, 3-5 March 2004. Final report.

- 09.00 Presentation of the conclusions of the workshop on NEPAD and Culture (Abidjan, 2003) by Mr Lupwishi Mbuyamba and the research plan of the Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa by Mr. Máté Kovács
- 09.30 Discussion
- 10.00 Cultural diversity and human development indicators – presentation by Mr. Mike van Graan
Human (including cultural) rights and human development indicators – presentation by Ms. Julia Hausermann
- 11.00 Human Rights, Culture and Gender – Presentation by Ms. Osvalda Joana
Women writers: Rights and Duties in community Development by Ms. Lília Momplé
- 11.30 Discussion
- 12.00 Lunch
- 14.00 The African angle: Cultural indicators of human development in Africa
Core concepts – Presentation by Mr Nchoji Nkwi
Identifying cultural indicators of human development in socio-economic development processes in Africa – in the light of the conclusions of the prospective study Africa 2025 – Presentation by Mr Alioune Sall
- 15.00 Discussion
- 16.00 Coffee break
- 16.30 The function of cultural policy in human development strategies and the contribution of culture to economic development (cultural industries and cultural enterprises): possible cultural development indicators of human development – Presentations by Mr. Stephen Chifunyise and Mr. James Sengendo
- 17.30 Discussion
- 18.00 End of session

Friday 5 March 2004

- 09.30 Conclusions from previous days – Summary by Ms. Annamari Laaksonen
- 10.00 Cultural indicators of human development: priorities for research and action – Introduction by Mr. Augustin Hatar
Discussion

- 12.00 Lunch
- 15.00 Conclusion and recommendations – Presentation of the draft report of the meeting by Mr. Jordi Baltà
- 16.00 Closing remarks
End of the meeting

Annex 2

Meeting of the Task Force for the Meeting of the International Seminar on Cultural
Indicators of Human Development in Africa

Maputo, 3-5 March 2004
Task Force Terms of Reference

Preamble:

The Task Force was established as one of the outcomes of this international seminar sponsored by UNESCO, OCPA, Interarts and the Forum Barcelona 2004. The seminar was called as a preparatory meeting for the Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development planned for Barcelona in August 2004, in the context of the Universal Forum of Cultures Barcelona 2004. The task force was set up following active debate on ways in which the African perspective on this subject can be represented at the forthcoming Congress. The discussions of the task force will be incorporated into the substantive proceedings of the Maputo seminar. The task force, in drawing its terms of reference, noted the importance of facilitating the engagement of the seminar's sponsors namely UNESCO, OCPA and Interarts with key stakeholders for the Barcelona Congress (Interarts, Forum 2004, UNESCO and Spanish Agency for International Cooperation) and supporting organizations including Rights and Humanity, OHCHR and UNDP. TORs were articulated:

Task Force members:

Mr S. Chifunyise (Chairing)
Prof. P. N. Nkwi
Dr A. Sall
Ms J. Hausermann
Dr A. K. Segobye (recording)
Dr F. Dava

OBJECTIVES:

1. To assist the sponsors and stakeholder in preparing inputs for the Barcelona meeting and other meetings identified as strategic for articulating the African perspective on cultural indicators for human development including human rights, particularly cultural rights. This is in recognition of the fact that the rich knowledge base demonstrated at this seminar should be brought to bear on a strategic planning process for influencing other platforms beyond the Barcelona Congress. These include the UNDP HDR launch in July 2004, the AU meeting of African intellectuals planned for November 2004, and the African Peer Review Mechanism and other activities within the framework of NEPAD.
2. To assist UNESCO and OCPA in the definition of the strategic priorities of a viable research project on cultural indicators taking into account the existing and possible resources (knowledge, expertise, funding and partnership) and the possible impact.

ACTIVITIES:

3. To assist in the process of mapping what needs to be done with regards to compilation of data from existing databases such as OCPA.
4. To facilitate the sponsors' development of a review study of what exists through the development of a framework for cultural indicators of human development in Africa.
5. To advise and assist the sponsors and stakeholders in the preparations for the Barcelona Congress through the identification of consultants to prepare position studies for the Congress.
6. To assist the sponsors' to access resources to enhance the African representation and participation at the Barcelona Congress.
7. To advise the sponsors of the Maputo meeting on monitoring implementation of the recommendations made.
8. To meet at least once, preferably in June, to review documents and identify progress with respect to commissioned studies for the Barcelona Congress and the other identified platforms listed above.
9. To engage the sponsors in raising resources to facilitate the work of the Task Force and for the activities envisaged to follow up the Maputo meeting.

TIME FRAME:

10. The Task Force shall serve for a period of time to be determined by the sponsors of the Maputo meeting and the stakeholders of the Barcelona Congress.

Annex 3

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

<p>Mr. Lupwishi Mbuyamba Representative of UNESCO in Mozambique Regional Cultural Adviser Member of the Steering Committee of OCPA Av.Frederick Engels 515R/C Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 493434 / 494903 / 494450 Fax: 258 1 493431</p>
<p>Mr. Máté Kovács Consultant Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa-OCPA 1024 Budapest Hungary Tel : 361 316 98 07 361 70 210 70 56</p>
<p>Mr. James Sengendo UNESCO Uganda Makerere University Uganda Tel. 256 41 534 114 Mobile 077 401 613 Care of the Ugandan National Commission for UNESCO</p>
<p>Mr. Paul Nchoji Nkwi Executive Director African Population Advisory Council (APAC) P.O. Box 10569 00100 Nairobi, GPO Kenya Tel: 254 2 72 80 63 Fax: 254 2 72 48 55 Mobile: 254-7220838033</p>
<p>Mr. Alioune Sall Cordonnateur Régional Programme « Futurs Africains », Programme des Nations Unies pour le Développement (PNUD) 01 B.P. 1747 Abidjan 01 Côte d'Ivoire Tel. 225 20 22 26 69, 20 22 26 70 Fax: 225 20 22 26 64 Cellphone: 225 05047877</p>

<p>Mr. Stephen Chifunyise Children's Performing Arts Workshop (CHIPAWO) P O BOX MR11 Marlborough Harare Zimbabwe Tel: 263 4870478 / 263 4300925 Fax: 263 4309929 Or c/o MC LAREN Robert Malcolm Exécutive Director CHIPAWO, 13 Mountbatten Drive Marlborough, Harare</p>
<p>Mr. Mike Van Graan General Secretary Article 27 DANSA Consultants Tel / Fax: 27 21 6740520 Cell: 27 8229003349 Cape Town South Africa</p>
<p>Ms. Annamari Laaksonen Coordinator of International Congress on Cultural Rights and Human Development Interarts Foundation C/Mallorca 272, 9a 08037 Barcelona Catalonia, Spain Tel. 34 93 487 7022 Fax. 34 93 487 2644</p>
<p>Mr. Jordi Baltà Interarts Foundation C/Mallorca 272, 9a 08037 Barcelona Catalonia, Spain Tel. 34 93 487 7022 Fax. 34 93 487 2644</p>
<p>Ms. Julia Hausermann Human Rights Lawyer and Development Practitioner NGO President Rights and Humanity 2- ST PETERS ST Ipswich, Suffolk IPI IXB UK Tel: 44 1473 286565 Fax: 44 1473 286720</p>
<p>Ms. Alinah Segobye Senior Lecturer in Archaeology, Botswana National Cultural Council University of Botswana History Department (Archaeology) P/Bag 00703 Gaborone Botswana Tel. 267 3552186 / 3972610 / 71625018 Fax. 267 3933507</p>

<p>Ms. Osvalda Joana Juíza de Direito- Coordenadora Tribunal Judicial e MULEIDE 215 Afonso Paiva Street Beira- Sofala Mozambique Tel. 258 3 323429 / 3 324310 / 3 313114 Fax. 258 3 23429 / 3 324310</p>
<p>Ms. Lília Momplé Writer Writer Association 954 Julius Nyerere Ave. 1st Floor P.O.Box 3626 Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 499411</p>
<p>Ms. Moji Okuribido-Seriki UNESCO, Windhoek Programme Specialist 12 Brahams Street Windhoek Namibia Tel. 264 61 291 7225 Fax. 264 61 291 7220</p>
<p>Mr. Pierre Dandjinou ICT-D Policy Adviser for Africa UNDP Chairperson of the Steering Committee of OCPA Dakar Senegal Telephone: 221 8491769</p>
<p>Mr. Augustin Hatar Dramatist/ Film Maker Senior Lecturer, University of Dar-Es-Salaam Member of the Steering Committee of OCPA P.O. Box 35044 Dar- Es-Salaam Tanzania Tel. 255 744 062 342</p>
<p>Ms. Angeline S. Kamba Member of the Steering Committee of OCPA 3 Hogsback Lane, Off Hogerty Hill Drive, P.O. Box BW 699 Borrowdale Harare Zimbabwe Tel. 263 4 860196 Fax. 263 4 860196</p>

Mobile: 263 11603549
Mr. Renato Matusse Director SADC National Commission Member of the Steering Committee of OCPA 780 Francisco Orlando Magumbwe Av., 10th Floor P.O Box 1154 Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 497942 Fax: 258 1 497942 / 492285
Mr. Fernando Dava Research Director General ARPAC-Instituto de Investigação Sócio-Cultural Rua de Bagamoio nº201 Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 431366 Fax. 258 1 431366
Mr. Book Sambo Assistente para a área de advocacia e reforma legal Liga Moçambicana dos Direitos Humanos Maguiguana Ave. 2219 Maputo, Mozambique Tel. 258 1 405941 / 401256 Fax. 258 1 406022
Mr. Domingos Artur National Director of Cultural Action Ministry of Culture Maputo Mozambique
Mr. Frederico Jamisse Jornalista Coopal - Artes e Letras Jornalistas Associados 780 Orlando Magumbwe Av. 9th Floor Maputo Mozambique Cell: 258 82 897189 Fax. 258 1 431027
Mr. Januário Mutaquiha Secretary-General of UNESCO National Commission Maputo Mozambique
Ms. Ana Piedade A. Monteiro

<p>Docente/ Investigadora Centro de Estudos Africanos Campus Universitário P. O Box 1993 Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 490828 Fax .258 1 491896 Cell: 258 82 447362</p>
<p>Ms. Julieta Marta Álvaro Massimbe Directora do MUSART Historiadora com especialidade em Documentação Museu Nacional de Arte 1233 Ho Chi Min Av. Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 320264</p>
<p>Ms. Fátima Amade Adviser to the Minister Ministry of High Education, Science and Technology 770 Patrice Lumumba Avenue Maputo Mozambique</p>
<p>Mr. Cardoso Tomás Muendane Consultant SICS Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 82 305705 Fax: 258 1 429246</p>
<p>Ms. Artemisa José Franco Executive Director Center for Research of Human Rights and Development 351 Comandante Moura Braz Street R/C 1st Floor P.O. Box. 2230 Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 401194 Fax: 258 1 401194</p>
<p>Mr. Sérgio Armando Mangué Researcher Historical Archives of Mozambique Filipe Samuel Magaia Ave. Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 321177 / 321178</p>
<p>Mr. Boaventura Afonso Director</p>

<p>Instituto Nacional do Livro e do Disco Ho Chi Min Street Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 314397 Fax. 258 1 314399</p>
<p>Mr. Admiro Gama Cuambe Coordenador de Projecto-PROVIDA PROVIDA Rua de França, Campus Universitário Pavilhão Académica Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 305546</p>
<p>Mr. Paulino Ricardo Programme Officer of Culture Doc & Information Mozambique National Commission for Unesco 45 Dr. Egas Moniz Street Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 493385 Cell: 258 82 823724</p>
<p>Mr. Celso dos Santos Dias Jornalista SAVANA Maputo Mozambique</p>
<p>Mr. Orlando Sebastião Mate Official on Navigation and Fishing Industrial Compony Fishing 25 de Setembro Avenue nº 1509 5 floor Maputo Mozambique Tel. Rádio Marine Communication UHF 16 HF 8220</p>
<p>Mr. Girmay Haile Chief Social Policy UNICEF 1440 Zimbabwe Avenue P.O.Box 4713 Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 481130</p>
<p>Mr. Szacay Jacques Adido Cultural French Embassy Maputo</p>

<p>Mozambique Tel: 258 1 491019 Fax: 258 1 491606</p>
<p>Ms. Kassam Zahra Program Officer Agha Khan Foundation 24 de Julho Ave./ Edifício Sua Alteza Agha Khan P.O. Box 746 Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 409001 258 1 409010</p>
<p>Ms. Mogne Severano Antuía Coordenadora para a Educação AKF- CRSP(M) 24 de Julho Ave. Edifício Sua Alteza Agha Khan P.O Box 746 Maputo Mozambique Tel. 258 1 409007 Fax. 258 1 409010</p>
<p>Ms. Ofélia da Silva Assistant Programme Officer UNESCO Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 493434 / 494903 / 494450 Fax: 258 1 493431 Mobile: 258 82 89 00 81</p>
<p>Mr. Pedro Cossa Local Coordinator, OCPA Secretariat Observatory of Cultural Policies in Africa (OCPA) 201, Rua do Bagamoyo Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 82717000 [when calling from outside Mozambique] Tel: 082717000 [when calling from Mozambique]</p>
<p>Ms. Yónese Vanessa Plinio Junior Documentalist Namaacha Avenue, 157, Matola A, Maputo Mozambique Mobile: 258 82 49 19 24</p>
<p>Ms. Paula Morais Administration Tel: 258 1 493434 / 494903 / 494450 Fax: 258 1 493431 Mobile: 258 82 89 00 81</p>

<p>Mr. Jaime Angelo Liaison Officer Tel: 258 1 493434 / 494903 / 494450 Fax: 258 1 493431 Mobile: 258 82 89 00 81</p>
<p>Mr. Justino Seia Driver Tel: 258 1 493434 / 494903 / 494450 Fax: 258 1 493431 Mobile: 258 82 89 00 81</p>
<p>Mr. Nhandol Maurício Mavie Rua do Telégrafo no. 10 Maputo Mozambique Tel: 258 1 48 50 50 Cell: 258 82 714690</p>